

From: buryi@list.ru

To: hj <hj@dse.co.kr>, softstorm305553 <softstorm305553@mail.ru>, doris_almaty <doris_almaty@mail.ru>, umirbayev <umirbayev@mtc.gov.kz>, ugdorstroi <ugdorstroi@mail.ru>, kuterbekov <kuterbekov@mtc.gov.kz>, amukay <amukay@worldbank.org>, dep-shm <dep-shm@rambler.ru>

19 October 2010, 14:58

Dear Sirs,

The Public Monitoring Group is sending you this letter with the attached 'Observations and Suggestions' in order to inform you that environmental review findings [conclusion] cannot be issued on the basis of the EIA report by GradStroiEkoProekt to be presented at a public hearing on 27 October 2010 in the village of Kazhymukan in the Ordanbasy District of South Kazakhstan *Oblast*.

Yours respectfully, Bauyrzhan Isaliev, Director of the Public Monitoring Group

From: buryi@list.ru

To: priroda.ork@mail.ru, amukay <amukay@worldbank.org>, Jbure <Jbure@worldbank.org>

25 November 2010, 13:43

Ms G. Sametova

Deputy Director

South Kazakhstan Oblast Directorate for Natural Resources
and Regulation of Natural Resource Use

Thank you for your letter no. 08/4240 dated 2 November 2010 in response to my letter no. 11 dated 29 October 2010.

I am writing to request that you inform me of the findings of your examination of my 'Observations on the EIA Report'.

If your office has already produced findings of the state environmental review of GradStroiEkoProekt's EIA report on the Temirlan Village Bypass project, I request that you send me the address of the internet site where I may consult them.

In compliance with the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan, I request that you reply in the language in which this request has been sent.

Yours respectfully, Bauyrzhan Isaliev, Director of the Public Monitoring Group for South Kazakhstan *Oblast*

From: buryi@list.ru

To: Jbure@worldbank.org

25 November 2010, 16:27

Dear Jacques,

Thank you for your letter.

I sent it to you for information. The first recipient (priroda.ork@mail.ru) will most probably issue state environmental review findings on the EIA report for the Temirlan Village Bypass. As you know, we, the public, have serious doubts regarding the report, and we have submitted our Observations. However, the state environmental experts did not take them into account. We are therefore waiting for the review findings to be officially published and will submit a complaint to the Inspection Panel of the World Bank.

I am aware of your scrupulous and titanic efforts to bring the South Kazakhstan *Oblast* resettlement plan to its logical conclusion and I am extremely satisfied. Your team has been a model of principled and unconditional compliance with the Bank's policies and procedures, something you also require from the

Developer. Recent articles in Kazakhstan's official press have shown how seriously the Kazakh Government view the implementation of the resettlement plan.

Thank you once more. Until we next speak. Bauyrzhan Isaliev

From: buryi@list.ru

To: Jbure <Jbure@worldbank.org>

umirbayev <umirbayev@mtc.gov.kz>, ugdorstroi <ugdorstroi@mail.ru>, kazi.hasan

CC: <kazi.hasan@snclavalin.com>, priroda.ork <priroda.ork@mail.ru>, Aynabat Yaylymova <ayaylymova@bicusa.org>

3 March 2011, 17:33

Dear Jacques,

1. As you are aware, the South Kazakhstan *Oblast* Resettlement Action Plan has been 90% implemented.

However, you have not replied to my letters no. 1 dated 21 December 2009 and no. 3 dated 9 January 2010, in which I outlined breaches of the World Bank's Operational Policy OP 4.12 and Procedure BP 4.12 'Involuntary resettlement'.

2. Moreover, the Bank's representative office in Astana has not commented at all on the 'Observations on GradStroiEkoProekt's EIA Report on the Temirlan Village Bypass' which was sent to Aliya Mukay in October 2010.

3. The work of the Canadian company SNC Lavalin, employed as a project management consultant, leaves much to be desired. Apart from an expert on involuntary settlement, Kanat Serdaliev, there are no company representatives in South Kazakhstan *Oblast*. The company has insufficiently and inadequately carried out external monitoring, in particular of compliance with the standards and requirements of the World Bank's information disclosure policy, environmental safety policy and heritage preservation policy. This is evidenced by the lack of proper evaluation of the EIA for the Temirlan Village Bypass, the excavation of the Khurlug settlement archaeological site, and the design of hydraulic engineering works on the irrigated farmland of the village Sary Ikan.

Unfortunately, our public monitoring group NAIR has been forced to send a complaint to the Aarhus Committee and the European Commission as well as the Board of Directors of the World Bank.

Yours respectfully, Bauyrzhan Isaliev, Director of the NAIR Public Monitoring Group